

Glenn Lester  
Park University  
November 2015

## Reading #1 Themes

Spring 2015 Students A, B, C, D, and E  
Controversy Project Draft 1, Controversy Project Draft 2, Research Paper Final Draft

### *Introduction*

In order to develop categories for a reading rubric, I used an open coding / grounded theory approach. First, I read older student work and noted both "positive indicators" and "opportunities for growth." I highlighted or bracketed sections of student prose and indicated in marginal commentary what I saw as a positive indicator or opportunity for growth. After this initial reading/coding, I organized my marginal comments by theme, as noted below. I will use these themes to develop a reading rubric for the reading and evaluation of future student work, in order to gauge the success of my intervention. It is also quite likely that I will use some or all of these categories in grading rubrics for students.

### *Themes*

#### **Reflection & Metacognition of Writing**

Reflection  
Metacognition  
Reflection  
Metacognition  
Reflection on writing  
Reflection on writing process  
Meta-cognition  
Reflection  
Metacognition  
Reflection/metacognition  
Metacognition re: writing  
Metacognition of what argument is about [by writing abstract]

#### **Title**

Opportunity for title  
Provocative title  
Opportunity for better title  
Opportunity for better heading  
Good, unique title

#### **Opening/Introduction**

Opportunity to open with a surprising connection or quote  
Surprising direct address [in opening]  
Direct opening  
Opportunity to create opening with sense of purpose and momentum  
Direct attention getter

### **Organization, Pattern, & Structure**

Clear organizational pattern  
Preview of organization  
Obvious organization  
Clear organizational pattern  
Clear organizational pattern  
Organized  
Clear, sensible organization  
Clear organization  
Logical organization  
Clear organizational pattern  
Clear organizational pattern

### **Occasion, Kairos, or "So What?"**

Explanation of why subject matters and to whom  
Explanation of why subject matters  
Opportunity to foreground argument in disagreement, controversy, or problem  
Opportunity to be specific and concrete re: problem  
Explanation of why subject matters and to whom  
Opportunity for showing controversy  
Identifies gaps in common understanding  
Opportunity to explain reasoning  
Outlines subject in real-world concern  
Establishes why it matters  
Opportunity to spell out subject/problem in detail  
Identifies a controversy/problem  
Identifies conflict/controversy  
Opportunity to spell out subject matter/problem  
Locates subject in real world, relevant concerns  
Establishes a problem  
Spells out relevance and need  
Why it matters  
Opportunity to spell out narrow, solvable problem  
Identifies a real debate/controversy  
Locates argument in student's real life  
Says why it matters

### **Clarity of Position, Purpose, & Claims**

Clarity of claims  
Direct statement of position  
Clarity of purpose  
Narrowing subject matter  
Explicit explanation of point  
Explicit explanation of point  
Opportunity for more precise explanations and support  
Clarity of claims

Opportunity to identify warrants and assumptions  
Direct statement of position  
Clarity of student's argument  
Clarifies argument  
Risky argument/position  
Opportunity to make an argument and take a stand  
Clear statement of claims  
Opportunity to spell out conclusions  
Explanation of logic  
Opportunity for clarifying position  
Opportunity for explaining/supporting position  
Opportunity to examine warrants and assumptions  
Opportunity for precision [in argument]  
Explicit claims  
Exacting, subtle argument  
Spells out position  
Spells out intent  
Opportunity to spell out a point of view  
Conclusion, summing up

### **Use of Examples to Illustrate Claims, Ideas, & Principles**

Opportunity for illustrative examples  
Use of personal experience  
Opportunity for more precise examples  
Opportunity for illustrative examples  
Opportunity to be concrete  
Use of relevant personal experience  
Use of relevant personal experience to support a point  
Use of personal experiences to illustrate point of view  
Relevant use of personal experience  
Use of precise, concrete example to illustrate  
Use of concrete examples  
Opportunity for illustrative examples  
Use of relevant personal experience  
Use of personal experiences to illustrate  
Concrete examples to illustrate argument  
Precise examples/evidence to illustrate argument  
Relevant use of student's personal experience

### **Solutions & Policy Recommendations**

Precise policy recommendations  
Opportunity to explain how policy proposal would solve problem  
Opportunity to explain how policy proposals [would solve problem]  
Policy proposals  
Opportunity for precise policy recommendations  
Opportunity to offer solutions

Opportunity to argue for precise solutions/policy proposals  
Explicit recommendations  
Identifies solutions  
Opportunity to conclude with actionable policy recommendations  
Opportunity for policy recommendations  
Opportunity for policy recommendations  
Opportunity for clear, extended policy proposals  
Policy recommendations

### **Source Selection**

Opportunity for further research  
Opportunity for research  
Use of peer-reviewed primary sources  
Reference to credible sources  
Opportunity for accuracy and source use  
Opportunity for textual research  
Opportunity for textual research  
Opportunity to Identify patterns through research  
Opportunity for primary sources or real research  
Opportunity to incorporate info found through textual research  
Opportunity for [textual] research  
Different types of sources  
Opportunity for additional evidence  
Use of credible sources  
Opportunity to incorporate source that's done primary research/"more credible"  
Opportunity for accuracy [in source info]  
Opportunity for further research  
Use of credible sources  
Opportunity for better sources

### **Use of Sources to Support or Debate a Claim**

Use of research to establish a claim  
Mention of precise, factual data  
Use of factual background info to establish the situation  
Use of factual background info to establish the "situation"  
Basic factual information  
Explanation of how to interpret source  
Explanation of how readers should think about quotation  
Implication of source  
Considers implication of a source  
Explanation of how readers should think re: quotations  
Opportunity to spell out [source] in detail  
Interpretation  
Opportunity to tell readers how to interpret evidence  
Precise evidence [from sources]  
Use of multiple sources to establish a point

Opportunity to sum up – say what it means  
Explains statistics  
Summary of source  
Synthesis of sources  
Opportunity to tell readers how to interpret  
Opportunity to explain statistics – tell us what to conclude  
Spells out how readers should interpret evidence  
Opportunity to tell readers how to interpret  
Source summary  
Clear explanations [of sources]  
Opportunity to explain why the source matters  
Opportunity to say why these numbers matter – summarize research for argument  
Applying concept/theory to a new subject  
Opportunity to "test" [claim] with evidence  
Fresh connections  
Use of sources  
Clear explication of sources  
Explication of source's argument  
Spells out what reader should conclude from source

### **Incorporating Quotations**

Incorporates quotes into student's own prose  
Opportunity to explain who source is  
Quote incorporated into student's own prose  
Quotation incorporated into student's own prose  
Quotation incorporated into student's own syntax  
Quotation incorporated  
Opportunity to incorporate into syntax  
Incorporates quote into student's own prose  
Source evidence incorporated into student's own prose  
Opportunity to incorporate quote in student's own prose  
Quote incorporated into student's own prose  
Quote incorporated into student's own prose  
Quote incorporated into student's own prose  
Quote incorporated into student's prose

### **Source Analysis & Context**

Explicit identification of sources and information  
Points out where research is lacking  
Awareness of where evidence comes from  
Identifies type of source  
Opportunity to Identify source by type/genre  
Identify source by type/genre/background  
Opportunity to Identify sources  
Opportunity to consider representativeness of evidence  
Opportunity to contextualize source

Opportunity to contextualize source  
Opportunity to explain/reflect on generalizability of evidence – or contextualize  
Opportunity to identify sources  
Opportunity to contextualize source  
Contextualizes info [from sources]  
Spells out source usage and source methodology  
Spells out possible flaws in source and method  
Opportunity to Identify sources  
Opportunity to Identify sources

### **Identification of Counterarguments & Multiple Perspectives**

Opportunity for more sources  
Explanation of outside points of view  
Opportunity to consider alternate solutions  
Consideration of alternate points of view  
Idea that problems have two sides [opportunity to consider multiple points of view]  
Addresses counterarguments  
Opportunity to fully treat various points of view  
Opportunity to explore counterarguments  
Consideration of multiple points of view  
Opportunity to identify new points of view  
Considers other/multiple points of view  
Use of qualifiers

### **Primary, Original, or New Research**

Suggests authentic primary research  
Opportunity for authentic research

### **Prose, Language, & Style**

Direct, precise language  
Opportunity for concise prose  
Precise language  
Could be more precise  
Opportunity to revise for conciseness  
Opportunity to revise for directness and conciseness  
Cliché  
Opportunity for preciseness and specificity  
Opportunity to revise for concise, direct, concrete language  
Opportunity for simpler syntax  
Opportunity for simpler syntax  
Direct, precise language  
Opportunity for concise prose  
Run-ons  
Comma splice  
Opportunity for balanced language  
Opportunity for clearer prose

Opportunity for specificity  
Opportunity for conciseness  
Concreteness  
Opportunity for more direct syntax  
Commas splice  
Opportunity for clarity in syntax  
Opportunity for balanced language  
Opportunity for balanced, un-stereotyped language [non-inflammatory]  
Opportunity for clarity in syntax  
Opportunity for clearer syntax  
Opportunity for clear syntax  
Opportunity for specificity  
Opportunity for clear syntax

**Use of Academic Conventions**

Opportunity to follow MLA conventions  
Opportunity to follow academic conventions  
Use of academic documentation conventions  
Use of academic conventions