In order to develop categories for a reading rubric, I used an open coding / grounded theory approach. First, I read older student work and noted both "positive indicators" and "opportunities for growth." I highlighted or bracketed sections of student prose and indicated in marginal commentary what I saw as a positive indicator or opportunity for growth. After this initial reading/coding, I organized my marginal comments by theme, as noted below. I will use these themes to develop a reading rubric for the reading and evaluation of future student work, in order to gauge the success of my intervention. It is also quite likely that I will use some or all of these categories in grading rubrics for students.

**Themes**

**Reflection & Metacognition of Writing**
- Reflection
- Metacognition
- Reflection
- Metacognition
- Reflection on writing
- Reflection on writing process
- Meta-cognition
- Reflection
- Metacognition
- Reflection/metacognition
- Metacognition re: writing
- Metacognition of what argument is about [by writing abstract]

**Title**
- Opportunity for title
- Provocative title
- Opportunity for better title
- Opportunity for better heading
- Good, unique title

**Opening/Introduction**
- Opportunity to open with a surprising connection or quote
- Surprising direct address [in opening]
- Direct opening
- Opportunity to create opening with sense of purpose and momentum
- Direct attention getter
**Organization, Pattern, & Structure**

Clear organizational pattern  
Preview of organization  
Obvious organization  
Clear organizational pattern  
Clear organizational pattern  
Organized  
Clear, sensible organization  
Clear organization  
Logical organization  
Clear organizational pattern  
Clear organizational pattern

**Occasion, Kairos, or "So What?"**

Explanation of why subject matters and to whom  
Explanation of why subject matters  
Opportunity to foreground argument in disagreement, controversy, or problem  
Opportunity to be specific and concrete re: problem  
Explanation of why subject matters and to whom  
Opportunity for showing controversy  
Identifies gaps in common understanding  
Opportunity to explain reasoning  
Outlines subject in real-world concern  
Establishes why it matters  
Opportunity to spell out subject/problem in detail  
Identifies a controversy/problem  
Identifies conflict/controversy  
Opportunity to spell out subject matter/problem  
Locates subject in real world, relevant concerns  
Establishes a problem  
Spells out relevance and need  
Why it matters  
Opportunity to spell out narrow, solvable problem  
Identifies a real debate/controversy  
Locates argument in student's real life  
Says why it matters

**Clarity of Position, Purpose, & Claims**

Clarity of claims  
Direct statement of position  
Clarity of purpose  
Narrowing subject matter  
Explicit explanation of point  
Explicit explanation of point  
Opportunity for more precise explanations and support  
Clarity of claims
Opportunity to identify warrants and assumptions
Direct statement of position
Clarity of student's argument
Clarifies argument
Risky argument/position
Opportunity to make an argument and take a stand
Clear statement of claims
Opportunity to spell out conclusions
Explanation of logic
Opportunity for clarifying position
Opportunity for explaining/supporting position
Opportunity to examine warrants and assumptions
Opportunity for precision [in argument]
Explicit claims
Exacting, subtle argument
Spells out position
Spells out intent
Opportunity to spell out a point of view
Conclusion, summing up

**Use of Examples to Illustrate Claims, Ideas, & Principles**
Opportunity for illustrative examples
Use of personal experience
Opportunity for more precise examples
Opportunity for illustrative examples
Opportunity to be concrete
Use of relevant personal experience
Use of relevant personal experience to support a point
Use of personal experiences to illustrate point of view
Relevant use of personal experience
Use of precise, concrete example to illustrate
Use of concrete examples
Opportunity for illustrative examples
Use of relevant personal experience
Use of personal experiences to illustrate
Concrete examples to illustrate argument
Precise examples/evidence to illustrate argument
Relevant use of student's personal experience

**Solutions & Policy Recommendations**
Precise policy recommendations
Opportunity to explain how policy proposal would solve problem
Opportunity to explain how policy proposals [would solve problem]
Policy proposals
Opportunity for precise policy recommendations
Opportunity to offer solutions
Opportunity to argue for precise solutions/policy proposals
Explicit recommendations
Identifies solutions
Opportunity to conclude with actionable policy recommendations
Opportunity for policy recommendations
Opportunity for policy recommendations
Opportunity for clear, extended policy proposals
Policy recommendations

**Source Selection**
Opportunity for further research
Opportunity for research
Use of peer-reviewed primary sources
Reference to credible sources
Opportunity for accuracy and source use
Opportunity for textual research
Opportunity for textual research
Opportunity to Identify patterns through research
Opportunity for primary sources or real research
Opportunity to incorporate info found through textual research
Opportunity for [textual] research
Different types of sources
Opportunity for additional evidence
Use of credible sources
Opportunity to incorporate source that's done primary research/"more credible"
Opportunity for accuracy [in source info]
Opportunity for further research
Use of credible sources
Opportunity for better sources

**Use of Sources to Support or Debate a Claim**
Use of research to establish a claim
Mention of precise, factual data
Use of factual background info to establish the situation
Use of factual background info to establish the "situation"
Basic factual information
Explanation of how to interpret source
Explanation of how readers should think about quotation
Implication of source
Considers implication of a source
Explanation of how readers should think re: quotations
Opportunity to spell out [source] in detail
Interpretation
Opportunity to tell readers how to interpret evidence
Precise evidence [from sources]
Use of multiple sources to establish a point
Opportunity to sum up – say what it means
Explains statistics
Summary of source
Synthesis of sources
Opportunity to tell readers how to interpret
Opportunity to explain statistics – tell us what to conclude
Spells out how readers should interpret evidence
Opportunity to tell readers how to interpret
Source summary
Clear explanations [of sources]
Opportunity to explain why the source matters
Opportunity to say why these numbers matter – summarize research for argument
Applying concept/theory to a new subject
Opportunity to "test" [claim] with evidence
Fresh connections
Use of sources
Clear explication of sources
Explication of source's argument
Spells out what reader should conclude from source

**Incorporating Quotations**
Incorporates quotes into student's own prose
Opportunity to explain who source is
Quote incorporated into student's own prose
Quotation incorporated into student's own prose
Quotation incorporated into student's own syntax
Quotation incorporated
Opportunity to incorporate into syntax
Incorporates quote into student's own prose
Source evidence incorporated into student's own prose
Opportunity to incorporate quote in student's own prose
Quote incorporated into student's own prose
Quote incorporated into student's own prose
Quote incorporated into student's own prose
Quote incorporated into student's own prose

**Source Analysis & Context**
Explicit identification of sources and information
Points out where research is lacking
Awareness of where evidence comes from
Identifies type of source
Opportunity to Identify source by type/genre
Identify source by type/genre/background
Opportunity to Identify sources
Opportunity to consider representativeness of evidence
Opportunity to contextualize source
Opportunity to contextualize source
Opportunity to explain/reflect on generalizability of evidence – or contextualize
Opportunity to identify sources
Opportunity to contextualize source
Contextualizes info [from sources]
Spells out source usage and source methodology
Spells out possible flaws in source and method
Opportunity to Identify sources
Opportunity to Identify sources

**Identification of Counterarguments & Multiple Perspectives**
Opportunity for more sources
Explanation of outside points of view
Opportunity to consider alternate solutions
Consideration of alternate points of view
Idea that problems have two sides [opportunity to consider multiple points of view]
Addresses counterarguments
Opportunity to fully treat various points of view
Opportunity to explore counterarguments
Consideration of multiple points of view
Opportunity to identify new points of view
Considers other/multiple points of view
Use of qualifiers

**Primary, Original, or New Research**
Suggests authentic primary research
Opportunity for authentic research

**Prose, Language, & Style**
Direct, precise language
Opportunity for concise prose
Precise language
Could be more precise
Opportunity to revise for conciseness
Opportunity to revise for directness and conciseness
Cliché
Opportunity for preciseness and specificity
Opportunity to revise for concise, direct, concrete language
Opportunity for simpler syntax
Opportunity for simpler syntax
Direct, precise language
Opportunity for concise prose
Run-ons
Comma splice
Opportunity for balanced language
Opportunity for clearer prose
Opportunity for specificity
Opportunity for conciseness
Concreteness
Opportunity for more direct syntax
Commas splice
Opportunity for clarity in syntax
Opportunity for balanced language
Opportunity for balanced, un-stereotyped language [non-inflammatory]
Opportunity for clarity in syntax
Opportunity for clearer syntax
Opportunity for clear syntax
Opportunity for specificity
Opportunity for clear syntax

**Use of Academic Conventions**
Opportunity to follow MLA conventions
Opportunity to follow academic conventions
Use of academic documentation conventions
Use of academic conventions