

## Table of Issues

**Propositions:** Augustine has the better view on managing disagreement.

**Points of clash:** 1.) Transmission of information (2-3 mins each)  
2.) How we deal with audiences that do not agree with us  
3.) Difference of truth

### **First Affirmative Construction: (Bronwyn)**

#### 1) **Transmission of Information**

- Weavers transmission of information is plain and easy to read and understand.
- Augustine thinks you should entertain your reader and to fill the reader with love and truth.

Augustine:

- "It is not the result of human institution that the expression of love wins over one's listeners, or that a brief or lucid narrative communicates facts efficiently, or that a variety holds the attention without creating boredom; these and other such observations are true whether applied to true matters or false, to the extent that they cause something to be known or believed, or influence minds to seek or to avoid something" (Book 2, Section 132)
- "The chief purpose of all that we have been saying in our discussion of things is to make it understood that the fulfilment and end of law and all the divine scriptures is to love the thing which must be enjoyed and thing which together with us can enjoyed and the thing which together with us can enjoy that thing." (Book 1, Section 84)

#### 2) **How We Deal with Audiences that Disagree with Us:**

- Weaver has only one path. Weaver thinks it's my way or the highway.
- Augustine thinks it's not about the end result but rather how you play the game

Augustine:

- "I say those who fail to understand what I write that is not my fault that they do not understand. Suppose they wanted to see the new moon, or the old one, or a star that was very faint, and I pointed it out with my finger but their eyesight was too weak to even see my finger- surely it would be wrong for them to be annoyed with me for that reason" (Preface, Paragraph 5-6).

#### 3) **The View of Truth:**

- Weaver
- Augustine believes in the divine truth which is unchangeable.

Augustine:

- "We must enjoy to the full that truth which lives unchangeably, and since, within it, God the Trinity, the author and creator of everything, takes thought for the things that he has created, our minds must be purified" (Book 1, Section 22)

- "Since rhetoric is used to give conviction to both truth and falsehood, who could dare to maintain that truth, which depends on us for its defense, should stand unarmed in the fight against falsehood"

However, Augustine does believe there can be multiple interpretations of the scriptures and truth.

- "There are certain rules for interpreting the scriptures which, as I am well aware, can usefully be passed on to those with an appetite for such a study to enable them to progress not just by reading the work of others who have illuminated the obscurities of divine literature, but also finding the illumination themselves" (Preface, Section 1)

- "Sometimes not just one meaning but two or more meanings are perceived in the same words of scripture. Even if the writer's meanings are obscure, there is no danger here, provided that it can be shown from other passages of the Holy Scriptures that each of these interpretations is consistent with the truth" (Book III, Section, 84)

### **First Negative construction:**

#### **1. Transmission of Information**

- Weaver tries to connect with the audience, not through affection, but instead by the use of fidelity

Quote: "Since the characteristic of this language is absence of anything like affection, it exhibits towards the thing being represented merely a sober fidelity... Instead of passion, it offers the serviceability of objectivity". (8)

- The language used is more providable.

- It focuses on a very specific type of grammar.

"The 850 words recommended for Basic English, for example, are highly available in the sense that all native users of English have them instantly ready and learners of English can quickly acquire them" (8).

- This allows for more people to understand what the initial message is, and also those who are not fluent in the language spoken can get a gist of what is being said as well.

#### **2. How We Deal with Audiences that Disagree with Us**

- Weaver brings people to see the truth

- Those who do not see the truth did not get the correct message that Weaver was trying to express

Quote: "So rhetoric at its truest seeks to perfect men by showing them better versions of themselves, links in that chain extending up toward the ideal, which only the intellect can apprehend and only the soul have affection for" (25).

- Weaver brings people to see a better self

- Basically if they disagree with Weaver, it is hurting them

#### **3) The View of Truth**

- What is true will always be true

Quote: "Through the years her clung tenaciously to this concept of genus, from which he could draw the proposition that what is fundamentally true of the family will be true also of the branches of the family". (95)

- There is a process in which truth works

- When something happens, there will be a repercussion of some sort

"It is a truism that as a war progresses, the basis of the war changes, and our civil conflict was no exception". (103)

### **Second Affirmative Construction:**

#### **1. Transmission of Information**

Quote(s): So the speaker who is endeavouring to give conviction to something that is good should despise none of these three aims-- of instructing, delighting, and moving his hearers...If he does this properly and appropriately he can fairly be called eloquent, even if he does not meet with his audience's assent.

To relate to these three aims -- of instructing, delighting, and moving an audience-- to the following three styles, So the eloquent speaker will be one who can treat small matters in a restrained style, intermediate matters in a mixed style, and important matter with grand style. (4.123. 96)

#### **2. How we deal with audiences that do not agree with us**

Quotes(s): "So it is part of the teacher's task not just to reveal what is hidden and solve knotty problems but also, while doing this, to anticipate other questions which may arise, in the case they undermine or refute what we are saying...But it is a very good idea to refute something that can be refuted, (4.127.110) In cases where you can't refute a case. (4.127.111)

#### **3. Difference of truth**

Quote(s):So, "in the wisdom of God the world was incapable of recognizing God through wisdom" (1.13.25) "Because human beginnings fell through pride it used humility in healing them, We were deceived by the wisdom of the serpent; we are freed by the foolishness of God. "We made bad use of immortality, and so died; Christ made good use of mortality, and so we live." (1.14. 28-29)

### **Second Negative construction:**

1.) **Transmission of information (2-3 mins):** Weaver thinks that the best argument for rhetoric is genus. "All arguments made through genus are arguments based on the nature of the thing which is said to constitute the genus; the idea of genus is a reflection of existence" (p. 56). The argument from definition, in his words, "includes all arguments from the nature of the thing. Whether the genus is an already recognized convention, or whether it is defined at the moment by the orator, or whether it is left to be inferred from the aggregate of its species, the argument has a single postulate" (p. 86).

2.) **How we deal with audiences that don't agree with us:** Weaver is a strong conservative so this issue is, in other words, how do we deal with liberal values. He critiques Edmund Burke and the argument of circumstance, stating this form of argument as "the nearest of all arguments to purest expediency. This argument merely reads the circumstances (the facts standing around) and accepts them as coercive, or allows them to dictate the decision" (p. 57). Weaver thinks that "such argument savors of urgency rather than of perspicacity; and it seems to be preferred by those who are easily impressed by existing tangibles" (p. 57).

### 3.) **Difference of truth:**

Truth belongs in the Metaphysical Dream which is made up of three levels. The first level is concerned with specific ideas and facts about the physical part of the world. The second level involves our beliefs. The third level is the Metaphysical Dream. This level is made up of philosophical opinion and judgmental standards. (11) Information from first two levels (ideas and beliefs) are verified at this level using values and ideals. Truth also come from dialectic. Weaver also thinks contrasts help represent truths, "...contrasts widen the gulf between truth and fallacy.." (Pg. 153)

### **Break - 1 Minute**

#### **First Negative Rebuttal:**

Augustine does not think that the portrayal of information is about the end result.

Shouldn't all speeches be about what the people take away as the end result?

Basically, every person could take away something completely different, which defeats the process of speaking to an audience.

"This is justified affection of which no one can be ashamed, and he who feels no influence of it is truly outside the communion of minds" (25).

This quote exemplifies that one true meaning works well.

Those who do not see the meaning clearly did not view the portrayal of information correctly and are out of their mind.

#### **First Affirmative Rebuttal:**

1-1:30 minutes

#### **How We Deal with Audiences that Disagree with Us (Attack on Point 2):**

When it comes to language, Weaver believes that something should be explained briefly and minimally so people can understand it. He believes that the audience should adapt to him, not the other way around. Again, it's Weaver's way or the highway.

Augustine says we must entertain and move the audience. We must do things through love and appease the audience.

"Do not rebuke an older man, but appeal to him as you would to a father. Treat younger men as brothers, old ladies as mothers, and young girls as sisters."

### **Second Negative Rebuttal:**

Augustine says that they should entertain their audience.

Weaver, on the other hand, wants his message to get out in a clear way. He forgets about ~~emotion~~ emotion and talks in a way that the majority of people can understand. This allows Weaver to get everyone on the same page. Although it might not be as fun and creative as Augustine, Weaver's style is easier to understand.

"A style in speech always causes one to be a marked man, and the public may not be so much impressed -at least, not initially- by what the man is for, or against, as by the fact that he has a style" (9).

### **Second Affirmative Rebuttal:**

Finally, Weaver believes there is only one meaning behind everything. Things have only one truth, one meaning, and one interpretation.

Augustine says there are multiple ways people can interpret rhetoric or scriptures. This is because people have different meanings and thoughts about things. Augustine adapts to the audience.

"Sometimes not just one meaning but two or more meanings are perceived in the same words of scripture. Even if the writers meanings is obscure, there is no danger here, provided that it can be shown from other passages of the Holy Scriptures that each of these interpretations is consistent with the truth" (Book III, Section, 84)