<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Excellent</th>
<th>Very good</th>
<th>Good</th>
<th>Marginal</th>
<th>Poor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Main points</strong></td>
<td>All clearly relevant to the proposition, insightful understanding of major issues, accurate. 27-30</td>
<td>All clearly relevant to the proposition, solid understanding of major issues, accurate. 24-26</td>
<td>Almost all clearly relevant to the proposition, basic understanding of major issues, and one or two minor inaccuracies. 21-23</td>
<td>Not all clearly relevant to the proposition, some misunderstanding or omission of major issues, some inaccuracies. 18-20</td>
<td>Significant problems in relevance to the proposition, understanding of issues, and accuracy. 0-17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Evidence</strong></td>
<td>Direct, relevant quotations from all relevant parts of Augustine and Weaver, 27-30</td>
<td>Direct, relevant quotations from some relevant parts of Augustine and Weaver, 24-26</td>
<td>Almost all direct, relevant quotations from some relevant parts of Augustine and Weaver, 21-23</td>
<td>Direct quotations from Augustine and Weaver used, but some not clearly relevant to the point or some missing, 18-20</td>
<td>Direct quotations from Augustine and Weaver used sporadically or not at all, problems with relevance, 0-17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Clash</strong></td>
<td>Identify major issues and authors' positions on them with clarity, precision, and accuracy. 23-25</td>
<td>Identify major issues and authors' positions on them with accuracy, but minor problems with clarity and precision. 20-22</td>
<td>Identify some major issues and authors' positions on them, but with minor problems with accuracy, clarity, and precision. 18-19</td>
<td>Identify topics more so than points of clash, and what authors say about the topics, with some problems with accuracy, clarity, and precision. 15-17</td>
<td>Identify topics more so than points of clash, and what authors say about the topics, with significant problems with accuracy, clarity, and precision. 0-14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Format and presentation</strong></td>
<td>Issues, positions, and evidence are clearly laid out and formatted for clarity, free from errors in spelling, grammar, punctuation, citation. 14-15</td>
<td>Issues, positions, and evidence are clearly laid out, almost free from errors in spelling, grammar, punctuation, citation. 12-13</td>
<td>Issues, positions, and evidence are laid out, some errors in spelling, grammar, punctuation, citation. 11</td>
<td>Issues, positions, and evidence are not formatted clearly enough to be easily distinguishable, errors in spelling, grammar, punctuation, citation. 9-10</td>
<td>Issues, positions, and evidence are presented unclearly, distracting number of errors in spelling, grammar, punctuation, citation. 0-8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTAL** 70